

Report from the University Faculty Affairs Committee  
University of Mary Washington  
February 22, 2012

Present:

Venitta McCall (Foundation, Leadership and Special Populations) – College of Education  
Leslie Martin (Sociology and Anthropology) – College of Arts and Sciences  
Keith Mellinger (Mathematics) –College of Arts and Sciences  
Patricia Orozco (Modern Foreign Languages) – College of Arts and Sciences  
Larry Penwell (Management and Marketing) – College of Business

Absent: Alan Griffith (Biology) – College of Arts and Sciences

The meeting came to order at 3:30pm in Trinkle 138.

The meeting was spent discussing issues related to the Promotion and Tenure policies and procedures outlined in the University Faculty Handbook. Section 2.6.4 of the Handbook charges UFAC with “ensuring that criteria and procedures for evaluation, promotion and tenure of each College (as approved by each College) adhere to the guidelines established in the University *Faculty Handbook*,” and to “Study and recommend changes in University-level promotion and tenure policies and procedures to the University Faculty Council.”

The committee reviewed university policies on tenure and promotion processes and drafted recommendations (below) to send to the UFC by the March 13 meeting.

**MOTION:** The UFAC moves that changes be made to Section 7 of the University Faculty Handbook as outlined on the attached document.

**Rationale:** After reviewing Section 7 of the University Faculty Handbook, the UFAC has decided that there is benefit in establishing a uniform *process* for promotion and tenure at the University. While there is good reason for the criteria for promotion and tenure to remain a college-level decision, there is also reason for every faculty member at the university to be guaranteed the same due process in their application for promotion and/or tenure.

Currently, the procedures for promotion are fairly uniform between colleges. The procedures for CAS and COB are virtually identical, while the procedure for COE simply refers the reader to the CAS procedure (See Section K.8.4). The only suggested change is that appeal committees be formed uniformly with one representative coming from the UFAC (with the restriction that this representative come from the appellant’s college). This allows for a single elected faculty committee to play a role in the appeal process, and acknowledges the UFAC’s role in providing university-level oversight in P&T matters.

The procedures between colleges for applying for tenure are also quite similar for COB and CAS. While COE's process bears some similarities, it does vary in substantial ways at the appeal stage. Section 7.6.1 of our Handbook states that "Tenure creates a mutual obligation between the University and the individual faculty member." As such, UFAC believes even more strongly that the procedures for applying for tenure should be at the university level.

To help guide the reader through the document:

The black type is what was there previously.

The red type was lifted from appendix I.

The blue type was added by UFAC

The green is just comments.

Respectfully submitted,

Leslie Martin, secretary

## SECTION 7

# PROMOTION AND TENURE PROCEDURES

*NOTE: This section contains ~~general~~ guidelines, expectations, and ~~deadlines~~ procedures that apply to the promotion and tenure processes at the University. Each college has ~~a separate~~ its own additional tenure and promotion policy document containing ~~additional~~ information about tenure and promotion criteria ~~and procedures~~. Each of these documents appears as an appendix in this Handbook; see the appendices I, J, and K. Applicants for promotion and/or tenure should be mindful of both the general requirements, expectations, and ~~deadlines~~ procedures as expressed in this section of the Handbook and the specific evaluative criteria, ~~procedures~~, ~~expectations~~, and other details that pertain to the promotion and tenure process as it is carried out in the faculty member's college and as detailed in the relevant appendix.*

*no recommended changes to sections:*

### **7.1 PROMOTION POLICY**

### **7.2 GENERAL MINIMUM PROMOTION REQUIREMENTS**

### **7.3 INDIVIDUAL CRITERIA FOR PROMOTION**

### **7.4 INSTITUTIONAL RANK STRUCTURE POLICY**

## **7.5 PROMOTION PROCEDURE**

~~Each college has its own set of promotion procedures. For the College of Arts and Sciences promotion procedures, see Appendix I; for the College of Business promotion procedure, see Appendix J; and for the College of Education promotion procedure, see Appendix K.~~

**.1** By May 1 of the spring semester preceding the academic year in which the minimum requirements for consideration for promotion will have been met, a request for promotion to the next higher professional rank may be initiated by the individual faculty member, or his or her department chair, by submitting such a request in writing to the appropriate department chair, who shall notify the appropriate college dean, who in turn will verify the length of service. When the length of service is verified, the dean will notify the Provost of the candidate's intention.

In the case of department chairs, requests for promotion should be submitted directly to the college dean. In this instance, the dean shall appoint, in consultation with the chair, a member of the faculty (from the chair's department whenever possible) who has tenure and the rank of full professor to act as his or her chair. The dean shall supply this appointee with the results of teaching evaluation materials and a copy of the chair's Annual Performance Review (APR) for each of the preceding academic years since the candidate's prior promotion. The appointee, after consultation with the other members of the department, shall prepare a written recommendation that promotion be granted or withheld from the chair and reasons for the specific recommendation.

**.2** The faculty member being considered for promotion and/or his or her department chair shall solicit from institutional colleagues and all tenured members of the faculty member's department

letters of recommendation as to whether or not promotion to the next higher rank should be granted to the faculty member. These letters become part of the promotion credentials file and should be received early enough to be included in the file before the August 31 deadline. The tenured members of the respective department may elect to submit a letter of abstention.

.3 By August 26 (or subsequent business day), the chair (or the appointee of the college dean, in the case of a chair seeking promotion) shall review his or her written recommendation regarding promotion and the reasons for the recommendation with the faculty member. The faculty member may submit a *letter of exception* to the dean by August 31. The chair shall submit the candidate's request for promotion, the chair's recommendation and reasons for the recommendation, and all letters submitted to the chair to the dean by August 31 for inclusion in the *promotion credentials file*.

.4 By August 31 (or subsequent business day), the candidate shall submit to the college dean the complete promotion credentials file (as described below). It is the candidate's responsibility to insure that the promotion credentials file is complete by this date.

.5 Each faculty member requesting promotion shall prepare a promotion credentials file. It shall be the responsibility of the faculty member to submit all pertinent data he or she wishes to have included in the file. For the remainder of the decision-making process, this file shall constitute the exclusive official written record by the candidate for the promotion of the procedure. The file must contain copies of all the faculty member's APRs since the last promotion. The file also contains a faculty data sheet providing information contained in the candidate's state personnel file (see §3.12.3) concerning the individual's degrees and dates received, terms of service, promotion record, and other personnel data as deemed appropriate: this faculty data sheet must be reviewed by the candidate, countersigned by the candidate, and is inserted in the candidate's promotion credentials file. Additional material required for the promotion credentials files are determined by the individual colleges. Candidates should consult the appropriate appendices of this Handbook. The file shall include all communications and documents developed as part of the process beginning with the initial letter requesting promotion. The file shall be accessible only to the faculty member involved, the College P&T Committee, Promotion Appeal Advisory Committee, the college dean, the Provost, the President, and the Board of Visitors. All persons asked to write evaluations and/or recommendations should be informed by the requester that these documents will be accessible to the faculty member. This file is due in the dean's Office by August 31.

.6 From August 31 until the file is conveyed to the College P&T Committee on September 7, the candidate has the right to review all materials in the file and write a letter of exception or explication to be included in the file. The candidate may not during this time remove materials from the file or modify them in any way. The file shall not be accessible to the candidate from the time that it is conveyed to the College P&T Committee until the promotion process and all appeals are complete. No material received after the credentials file is transmitted to the College P&T Committee will be included in the credentials file or used in the promotion consideration, to assure that the same documentary record form the basis for recommendations on promotion at each level of review. After the appeals are exhausted, the material supplied by the college dean and the letters of recommendation (and of exception, if any) shall be inserted in the University

personnel file (see §3.12.4) maintained by the Office of the Provost; material submitted by the faculty member shall be returned to him or her.

.7 On September 7, or subsequent business day if September 7 falls on the weekend, the promotion credentials file is officially closed and the college dean shall transmit the faculty member's promotion credentials file to the College P&T Committee.

.8 The College P&T Committee shall carefully study each promotion credentials file and shall formulate and submit by January 5 a recommendation to the college dean on whether promotion should be granted or withheld, together with a written justification for each recommendation. The number of faculty members recommended for promotion to each rank shall not exceed the numbers in the guidance provided by the dean. The recommendations and justifications of the committee shall be included in the appropriate credentials files and, ultimately, in the faculty members' University personnel file.

.9 Within one week (five working days), the college dean shall inform each faculty member requesting promotion of the College P&T Committee's recommendation, of the justifications for the recommendation pertaining to him or her, and of the faculty member's right to appeal.

.10 No later than January 17, (or the subsequent business day) faculty members requesting promotion may appeal the recommendations of the College P&T Committee by submitting a request for reconsideration and justification for such reconsideration on the basis of procedural or substantive grounds to the college dean.

.11 In each instance when an appeal is requested, the college dean shall, within one working week, establish a Promotion Appeal Advisory Committee (PAAC) that shall be composed of one member of the CAS University Faculty Affairs Committee (UFAC), selected by the committee from the candidate's college; one member appointed by the college dean; one member appointed by the Provost; and one member appointed by the appellant. ~~The representative from the University Faculty Affairs Committee may be an ex-officio member of FAC.~~ If no member of the UFAC is eligible to serve on the PAAC, the committee will select an eligible faculty member from the candidate's college who, if possible, has previously served on the UFAC. No person on the PAAC, other than the person selected by the appellant, should be a faculty member who has written a letter of recommendation for the candidate's promotion and/or tenure file. In the event of multiple appeals within a college, the three members appointed respectively by the University Faculty Affairs Committee, the dean, and the Provost shall serve on each appeal committee within that college; the member selected by the appellant shall serve only on the committee reviewing the appeal of his or her selector. All members serving on the PAAC shall be tenured and have the rank of full professor.

.12 The PAAC, with access to all information available to the original College P&T Committee for all applicants in the respective college to the rank sought by the appellant, shall reconsider the recommendations of the original committee. In addition, the PAAC will have access to both the letter of recommendation from the College P&T Committee as well as the applicant's letter of appeal. The PAAC shall report to the college dean within four weeks, either endorsing the

original report or presenting an alternative recommendation in writing. The college dean shall inform the appellant of the PAAC's recommendation within two working days.

.13 The college dean shall review all information and recommendations contained in the promotion credentials file of each faculty member in his or her college, shall formulate and state in writing his or her recommendations, with reasons, and shall forward these and the promotion credentials files to the Provost by March 10. A copy of this letter will be sent to the faculty member and his or her department chair. When the college dean recommends that promotion be withheld, the recommendation letter from the dean shall inform the faculty member of his or her right to appeal the dean's recommendation, in writing, within seven days to the Provost. (see §7.12.2.)

.14 The Provost shall review the recommendation letter from the college promotion and tenure committee along with the recommendation letter from the dean. The Provost shall formulate and state in writing his or her recommendation and shall submit this letter to the President by April 1. A copy of this letter shall be sent to the faculty member, his or her department chair, and the dean. When the Provost recommends that promotion be withheld, the recommendation letter from the Provost shall inform the faculty member of his or her right to appeal the Provost's recommendation, in writing, within seven days to the President and the Board of Visitors. . (see §7.12.3.)

.15 The Board of Visitors (or the Executive Committee thereof) in consultation with the President shall, no later than May 15, review all information of record, as well as any written appeals, and shall render a final decision in the matter and so notify each candidate, his or her department chair, the dean, and the Provost in writing. Action by the Board of Visitors (or the Executive Committee thereof) shall be final. . (see §7.12.4.)

.16 All official notification of administrative action shall be by certified mail.

## **7.6 TENURE POLICY no proposed changes**

## **7.7 TENURE REQUIREMENTS no proposed changes**

## **7.8 TENURE PROCEDURE**

.1 During the years preceding the sixth probationary year (or the year in which the tenure decision is made), the department chair will be a mentor to the tenure candidate. The tenure candidate will be apprised in writing of strengths and areas that need improvement as part of his or her performance evaluation. If the formative evaluation and assistance do not improve the level of performance of a candidate, he or she may be dismissed before the sixth probationary year (see §3.17).

.2 By May 1 of the spring semester preceding the final year of the probationary period, it is the responsibility of the individual faculty member desiring tenure to request in writing of his or her department chair that he or she be considered for tenure. (In the case of a department chair

seeking tenure as a faculty member, the dean, in consultation with the chair involved, shall appoint someone to act in the role of chair.) Should a faculty member not request tenure as specified, he or she will be notified in writing that the seventh year of service will be the terminal year of employment at the University unless the individual is offered and elects to accept a term contract without tenure.

.3 It is the department chair's responsibility to solicit a written evaluation and recommendation for or against tenure or a written statement of abstention. These letters are to be delivered to the department chair from each tenured member of the department by August 22. At his or her discretion, the chair may solicit a maximum of five additional letters from faculty members inside or outside of the department. **These letters become part of the promotion credentials file and should be received early enough to be included in the file before the August 31 deadline.** When the department chair (or a substitute) requests recommendations on the matter of a candidate's promotion or tenure, he or she will promptly provide the candidate with a list of those from whom letters have been requested. The department chair shall be responsible for transmitting these recommendations to the dean for inclusion in the *tenure credentials file*. If a faculty member, after being requested to submit a recommendation, declines or fails to present a written recommendation, the procedure for determining tenure shall proceed, and the fact that one or more recommendations are not obtained shall not void the process. The faculty member requesting tenure may solicit letters of recommendation from other faculty members inside or outside of his or her assigned department, and at the faculty member's request such letters shall be included in the tenure credentials file. The faculty member requesting tenure also may include in the file such other documents and materials, including publications, as he or she may desire.

.4 By August 26, the chair (or the appointee of the dean, in the case of a chair seeking tenure as a faculty member) shall review his or her written recommendation(s) regarding tenure and the reasons for the recommendation with the faculty member. The faculty member may submit a *letter of exception* to the dean by August 31. The chair shall submit the candidate's request for tenure, the chair's recommendation and reasons for the recommendation, and all letters submitted to the chair to the dean by August 31 for inclusion in the tenure credentials file.

.5 Each faculty member requesting tenure shall prepare a tenure credentials file. (Persons applying simultaneously for promotion and tenure prepare only one file.) It shall be the responsibility of the faculty member to submit all pertinent data he or she wishes to have included in the file, and the file must include copies of the APRs for each of the preceding academic years of the faculty member's probationary period (normally five years but sometimes fewer). The file also contains a faculty data sheet providing information contained in the candidate's state personnel file (see §3.12.3) concerning the individual's degrees and dates received, terms of service, promotion record, and other personnel data as deemed appropriate: this faculty data sheet must be reviewed by the candidate, countersigned by the candidate, and is inserted in the candidate's tenure credentials file. For the remainder of the decision-making process, this file shall constitute the exclusive official written record of the procedure. The file shall include all communications and documents developed as part of the process beginning with the initial letter requesting promotion. The file shall be accessible only to the faculty member involved, the **College** P&T Committee, PAAC, the **college** dean, the Provost, the President, and the Board of Visitors. All persons asked to write evaluations and/or recommendations should be

informed by the requester that these documents will be accessible to the faculty member. This file is due in the dean's Office by August 31.

.6 From August 31 until the file is made available to the College P&T Committee on September 7, the candidate has the right to review all materials in the file and to write a letter of exception or explication for inclusion in the file. The candidate may not during this time remove materials from the file or modify them in any way. The file shall not be accessible to the candidate from the time that it is made available to the College P&T Committee until the tenure process and all appeals are complete. No materials received after the file is transmitted to the College P&T Committee will be included in the file or used in the tenure consideration, to insure that the same documentary record forms the basis for tenure recommendations at each level of review. After the appeals are exhausted, any materials supplied by the dean, the letters of recommendation, and any letters of exception shall be inserted in the faculty member's college personnel file (see §3.12.4); materials submitted by the faculty member shall be returned to him or her.

.7 On September 7 or the following subsequent business day if September 7 falls on the weekend, the dean shall transmit the faculty member's tenure credentials file to the College P&T Committee.

.8 The College P&T Committee shall carefully study each tenure credentials file and shall formulate and submit a recommendation to the dean as to whether tenure should be awarded or withheld for each faculty member together with a written justification for each recommendation. The recommendations and justifications of the committee shall be included in the appropriate credentials files.

.9 Within one week (five working days), the college dean shall inform each faculty member requesting tenure of the College P&T Committee's recommendation, of the justifications for the recommendation pertaining to him or her, and of the faculty member's right to appeal.

.10 No later than January 17, faculty members requesting tenure may appeal the recommendations of the College P&T Committee by submitting a request for reconsideration and justification for such reconsideration on the basis of procedural or substantive grounds to the dean.

.11 In each instance when an appeal is requested, the college dean shall, within one working week, establish a Tenure Appeal Advisory Committee (TAAC) which shall be composed of one member of the University Faculty Affairs Committee selected by the committee, one member appointed by the college dean, one member appointed by the Provost, and one member appointed by the appellant. No person on the TAAC, other than the person selected by the appellant, should be a faculty member who has written a letter of recommendation for the candidate's promotion and/or tenure file. In the event of multiple appeals, the three members appointed respectively by the UFAC, the dean, and the Provost shall serve on each appeal committee; the member selected by the appellant shall serve only on the committee reviewing the appeal of his selector. All members serving on the TAAC(s) shall be tenured. In the case that a candidate is appealing both a tenure and a promotion decision, only one appeal committee will be formed. This committee will act as the appeal committee for both tenure and promotion.

.12 The TAAC, with access to all information available to the original College P&T Committee, shall reconsider the recommendations of the original committee. In addition, the TAAC will have access to both the letter of recommendation from the College P&T Committee as well as the applicant's letter of appeal. The TAAC shall report to the college dean within four working weeks, either endorsing the original report or else presenting an alternative recommendation in writing. The college dean shall inform the appellant of the TAAC's recommendation within two working days.

.13 The college dean shall review all information and recommendations contained in the tenure credentials file of each faculty member; shall formulate and state in writing his or her recommendations, with reasons; and shall forward these and the tenure credentials files to the Provost by March 10. A copy of this letter will be sent to the faculty member and his or her department chair.

.14 When considering tenure decisions, the college dean must consider each application according to criteria expressed in the *Faculty Handbook*. The college dean must also consider carefully the rank and tenure profiles of the college and the university, projected enrollment patterns, staffing needs, current and projected mission of each department, the specific academic competence of the faculty member, and the preservation of opportunities for the infusion of new talent.

.15 When the college dean recommends that tenure be withheld, the recommendation letter from the dean shall inform the faculty member of his or her right to appeal the dean's recommendation, in writing, within 7 days to the Provost. (see §7.12.2.)

.16 The Provost shall review the recommendation letter from the promotion and tenure committee along with the recommendation letter from the college dean. The Provost shall formulate and state in writing his or her recommendation and shall submit this letter to the President by April 1. A copy of this letter shall be sent to the faculty member, his or her department chair, and the dean. When the Provost recommends that tenure be withheld, the recommendation letter from the Provost shall inform the faculty member of his or her right to appeal the Provost's recommendation, in writing, within 7 days to the President and the Board of Visitors. . (see §7.12.3.)

.17 The President and the Board of Visitors (or the Executive Committee thereof), shall, within one month, review all information of record, as well as any written appeals and shall render a final decision in the matter and so notify the faculty member, his or her department chair, the dean, and the Provost in writing. Action by the Board of Visitors, or the Executive Committee thereof, shall be final. If tenure is denied, a one-year contract will be offered to the faculty member. The Board of Visitors may offer additional one-year contracts but such additional contracts carry no right to tenure. . (see §7.12.4.)

.18 All official notification to the candidate of administrative action shall be by certified mail.

## **7.9 GENERAL PROMOTION AND TENURE CALENDAR** no proposed changes

## **7.10 CONTENTS OF THE PROMOTION AND TENURE FILE**

Each candidate for promotion and/or tenure prepares a promotion and/or tenure credentials file. At a minimum, each such file must contain:

- a letter of application to chair/dean;
- personnel data sheet;
- *curriculum vitae*;
- all applicable Faculty Annual Activity Reports and Annual Performance Reviews; and
- letters of recommendation.

Each college has its own additional set of requirements for the preparation of the promotion and tenure credentials file. For the promotion and tenure file requirements followed by the College of Arts and Sciences, see Appendix I; for the requirements applying in the College of Business promotion, see Appendix J; and for the College of Education, see Appendix K. [On September 7, or subsequent business day if September 7 falls on the weekend, the promotion and/or tenure credentials file is officially closed.](#)

## **7.11 EXPECTATIONS FOR THE CONSTITUENTS IN THE PROMOTION AND TENURE PROCESS**

Each college has expressed a set of expectations for each of the constituents in the promotion and tenure process. For the expectations expressed by the College of Arts and Sciences, see Appendix I; for the College of Business, see Appendix J; and for the College of Education, see Appendix K.

## **7.12 THE UNIVERSITY'S EXPECTATIONS FOR THE PROMOTION AND TENURE PROCESS**

The University Faculty Affairs Committee (~~UFCA~~ [UFAC](#)) is charged with oversight of the promotion and tenure criteria and processes used by all colleges at the University. The goal of this oversight process is to ensure that the promotion and tenure criteria and procedures as established by each college are clearly stated and in parallel with one another. Additionally, the ~~UFCA~~ [UFAC](#) is charged with ensuring that promotion and tenure criteria and procedures of each college adhere to the guidelines established in the *University Faculty Handbook*, and that any changes undergo an oversight review prior to implementation.

## **7.12 PROMOTION AND TENURE APPEALS**

~~**7.12.1 Appeal of the P & T Committee's Recommendation** When the College P&T Committee submits a recommendation to withhold promotion and/or tenure, the dean shall inform the faculty member of the P&T Committee's recommendation, of the justifications for the recommendation, and of the faculty member's right to appeal. Details regarding procedures for appealing the P & T Committee's recommendation are contained in the relevant appendix outlining the college's tenure and promotion policy and procedures. For the College of Arts and Sciences, see Appendix I; for the College of Business, see Appendix J; and for the College of~~

Education, see Appendix K.

**7.12.2 Appeal of the Dean's Recommendation** The dean shall review all information and recommendations contained in the promotion and/or tenure credentials file of each faculty member, shall formulate and state in writing his or her recommendations, with reasons, and shall forward these and the promotion credentials files to the Provost. A copy of this letter will be sent to the faculty member and his or her department chair. When the dean recommends that promotion and/or tenure be withheld, the recommendation letter from the dean shall inform the faculty member of his or her right to appeal the dean's recommendation, in writing, within seven days to the Provost.

**7.12.3 Appeal of the Provost's Recommendation** The Provost shall review the recommendation letter from the P & T Committee along with the recommendation letter from the dean. The Provost shall formulate and state in writing his or her recommendation and shall submit this letter to the President. A copy of this letter shall be sent to the faculty member, his or her department chair, and the dean. When the Provost recommends that promotion and/or tenure be withheld, the recommendation letter from the Provost shall inform the faculty member of his or her right to appeal the Provost's recommendation, in writing, within seven days to the President and the Board of Visitors.

**7.12.4 Appeal of the President and Board of Visitors** The Board of Visitors (or the Executive Committee thereof) in consultation with the President shall, no later than May 15, review all information of record, as well as any written appeals, and shall render a final decision in the matter and so notify each candidate, his or her department chair, the college dean, and the Provost in writing. Action by the Board of Visitors (or the Executive Committee thereof) shall be final.